

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO
EASTERN DIVISION**

MELISSA MCFADDEN,

Plaintiff,

v.

CITY OF COLUMBUS,

Defendant.

Case No. 2:18-cv-544

Chief Judge Edmund A. Sargus, Jr.

Magistrate Judge Jolson

DEFENDANT'S EXHIBIT LIST

Defendant City of Columbus intends to use the following exhibits at trial in this civil action, depending on the scope of Plaintiff's case:

1. Defense Exhibit 1 Email Tate to Grizzell March 2, 2017 (Doc.036-6)
2. Defense Exhibit 2 Email Morefield to Grizzell March 6, 2017 (Doc.036-7)
3. Defense Exhibit 3 Email Johnson to Grizzell March 6, 2017 (Doc.36-8)
4. Defense Exhibit 4 IAB Investigation: Investigative Summary Regarding Allegation I (Doc.038-2)
5. Defense Exhibit 5 IAB Investigation: Investigative Summary Regarding Allegation III (Doc. 038-3)
6. Defense Exhibit 6 IAB Investigation: Table of Contents (Doc. 038-4)
7. Defense Exhibit 7 IAB Investigation: Complaint Narrative (Doc. 038-5)
8. Defense Exhibit 8 IAB Investigation: Grizzell Letter of Information and Attachments (Doc. 038-6)
9. Defense Exhibit 9 IAB Investigation: Information from Grizzell (Doc. 038-7)
10. Defense Exhibit 10 IAB Investigation: Emails from McFadden regarding Tate (Doc. 038-8)
11. Defense Exhibit 11 IAB Investigation: Texts exchanged between McFadden and Morefield (Doc. 038-9)

12. Defense Exhibit 12 IAB Investigation: September 1, 2016 5240 E. Main St. (Doc. 038-10)
13. Defense Exhibit 13 IAB Investigation: regarding October 21, 2015 394 E. Hinman Ave. (Doc. 038-11)
14. Defense Exhibit 14 IAB Investigation: 2016 Annual Report (Doc. 038-12)
15. Defense Exhibit 15 IAB Investigation: Information provided by Officer Jeffrey Kasza (Doc. 038-13)
16. Defense Exhibit 16 IAB Investigation: Inventory of contents from L2B desk November 17 2017 (Doc. 038-14)
17. Defense Exhibit 17 IAB Investigation: Temporary assignment information (Doc. 038-15)
18. Defense Exhibit 18 IAB Investigation: Information concerning May 2016 Oral Board Committee (Doc. 038-16)
19. Defense Exhibit 19 IAB Investigation: Training records (Doc. 038-17)
20. Defense Exhibit 20 IAB Investigation: Miscellaneous information included in investigation (Doc. 038-18)
21. Defense Exhibit 21 IAB Investigation: Resources relied upon by Sgt. Weaver (Doc. 038-19)
22. Defense Exhibit 22 February 9 2018 Letter specifying allegations investigated and investigator recommendation (Doc. 038-20)
23. Defense Exhibit 23 February 9, 2018 email from Vollmer (Doc. 038-21)
24. Defense Exhibit 24 February 14, 2018 email Jacobs to Bodker (Doc. 038-22)
25. Defense Exhibit 25 Jacobs April 18, 2018 Letter to McFadden regarding Departmental Charges and Hearing (Doc. 038-23)
26. Defense Exhibit 26 Jacobs Determination regarding IAB Investigation (Doc. 038-24)
27. Defense Exhibit 27 Jacobs letter to Director of Public Safety (Doc. 038-25)
28. Defense Exhibit 28 Transcript of McFadden's Chief's Hearing (Doc. 36-37)
29. Defense Exhibit 29 McFadden's Director's Hearing Decision (Doc. 36-75)
30. Defense Exhibit 30 Email Kuebler to Dunlap and Grizzell dated March 10, 2017 (Doc. 36-12)

31. Defense Exhibit 31 McFadden Relieved from Assignment Notification March 12, 2017 (Doc. 36-13)
32. Defense Exhibit 32 McFadden Job Application Property Room (Doc. 033-2)
33. Defense Exhibit 33 McFadden Job Application TRACT Lieutenant (Doc. 033-3)
34. Defense Exhibit 34 McFadden Accident Report (Doc. 033-4)
35. Defense Exhibit 35 Ohio Industrial Commission Record of Proceedings (Doc. 033-5)
36. Defense Exhibit 36 Ohio Industrial Commission Record of Proceedings (Doc. 033-6)
37. Defense Exhibit 37 McFadden Work Assignments (Doc. 033-7)
38. Defense Exhibit 38 List of Information regarding vests (Doc. 033-8)
39. Defense Exhibit 39 List of information regarding vests (Doc. 033-9)
40. Defense Exhibit 40 List of information regarding vests (Doc. 033-10)
41. Defense Exhibit 41 Complaint Case No 18-cv-544 (Doc. 033-13)
42. Defense Exhibit 42 McFadden Grievance March 20, 2017 (Doc. 033-15)
43. Defense Exhibit 43 McFadden tuition reimbursement document (Doc. 033-16)
44. Defense Exhibit 44 McFadden OCRC Filing May 3, 2017 (Doc. 033-17)
45. Defense Exhibit 45 McFadden OCRC filing August 2, 2018 (Doc. 033-18)
46. Defense Exhibit 46 McFadden OCRC filing August 2, 2018 (Doc. 033-19)
47. Defense Exhibit 47 McFadden OCRC filing March 4, 2019 (Doc. 033-20)
48. Defense Exhibit 48 Routing Sheets Unfounded McFadden Grizzell (Doc. 033-21)
49. Defense Exhibit 49 Walking the Thin Black Line (Doc. 033-22)
50. Defense Exhibit 50 McFadden email chain with attachments (Doc. 033-24)
51. Defense Exhibit 51 Flyer and emails (Doc. 033-25)
52. Defense Exhibit 52 McFadden texts Bernadine Kennedy Kent (Doc. 33-28)
53. Defense Exhibit 53 McFadden texts Jodi Ann (Doc. 33-29)
54. Defense Exhibit 54 Jacobs Recommendation Dated May 15, 2018 (Doc. 036-4)

55. Defense Exhibit 55 Email dated June 28, 2017 to IABDeskSgt from Jeff Kasza (Doc. 036-5)
56. Defense Exhibit 56 Copies of text messages (Doc. 36-9)
57. Defense Exhibit 57 Handwritten notes regarding Felicia Saunders (Doc. 36-10)
58. Defense Exhibit 58 Email chain regarding LION reporting McFadden dated July 28, 2017 (Doc. 36-14)
59. Defense Exhibit 59 Memo Jacobs to Grizzell dated March 9, 2017 (Doc. 36-34)
60. Defense Exhibit 60 Jacobs Recommendations McFadden May 17, 2018 (Doc. 36-32)
61. Defense Exhibit 61 McFadden Relieved from Assignment Notification May 17, 2018 (Doc. 36-35)
62. Defense Exhibit 62 Email regarding McFadden dated November 29, 2017 (Doc. 36-65)
63. Defense Exhibit 63 60 Day Review with Lt McFadden Gardner 001 to 004 (Doc. 36-76)
64. Defense Exhibit 64 Notes on McFadden Reassignment Gardner 020 to 024 (Doc. 36-77)
65. Defense Exhibit 65 Position Statement of City regarding McFadden (Doc. 36-39)
66. Defense Exhibit 66 McFadden Charge of Discrimination (Doc. 36-40)
67. Defense Exhibit 67 McFadden Grievance (Doc. 36-57)
68. Defense Exhibit 68 Memo from Jacobs to Vollmer dated November 16, 2017 (Doc. 36-16)
69. Defense Exhibit 69 CPD EEO Directive 808 (Doc. 036-3)
70. Defense Exhibit 70 IAB SOP Investigative Procedures (Doc. 36-20)
71. Defense Exhibit 71 IAB SOP Unique Investigations (Doc. 36-22)
72. Defense Exhibit 72 IAB SOP Investigative Procedures (Doc. 36-23)
73. Defense Exhibit 73 CPD Directive regarding Sworn Performance Evaluations (Doc. 36-73)
74. Defense Exhibit 74 Transcript of Interview of Grizzell March 30, 2017 (Doc. 36-36)
75. Defense Exhibit 75 Transcript of Tate Interview dated April 20, 2017 (Doc. 36-70)

76. Defense Exhibit 76 Transcript of IAB Interviews of Morefield (Doc. 36-74)
77. Defense Exhibit 77 IAB Investigative Summary and Recommendation Nemchev (Doc. 038-28)
78. Defense Exhibit 78 IAB Investigative Summary and Recommendation Mabry (Doc. 038-29)
79. Defense Exhibit 79 IAB Investigative Summary and Recommendation Grizzell (Doc. 038-30)
80. Defense Exhibit 80 IAB Investigative Summary and Recommendation Grunkemeyer (Doc. 038-31)
81. Defense Exhibit 81 [Doc. 36-38 Dep Ex LL) (IAB Investigative Summary Falacia Dragin)
82. Defense Exhibit 82 [Doc. 36-41 Dep Ex 00) (Falacia Dragin OCRCWitness Statement)
83. Defense Exhibit 83 Pages 60 to 63 of the Patrol Zone 2 2016 Annual Report (Doc. 36-43)
84. Defense Exhibit 84 Excerpt from Patrol Zone 2 Annual Report (Doc. 36-44)
85. Defense Exhibit 85 IAB Complaint Narrative Nemchev (Doc. 36-19)
86. Defense Exhibit 86 IAB Recommendations Nemchev (Doc. 36-29)
87. Defense Exhibit 87 Edley email regarding Nemchev (Doc. 36-62)
88. Defense Exhibit 88 Email dated January 14, 2018 Commander Grizzell from Larry Ferguson (Doc. 36-15)
89. Defense Exhibit 89 IAB Investigative Summary Nemchev (Doc. 36-63)
90. Defense Exhibit 90 IAB Investigative Summary and Recommendation Moore (Doc. 038-33)
91. Defense Exhibit 91 Routing Sheet Moore (Doc. 038-34)
92. Defense Exhibit 92 Arbitration Opinion and Award Moore (Doc. 038-35)
93. Defense Exhibit 93 Memo regarding Odom's complaint dated November 16, 2017 (Doc. 36-56)
94. Defense Exhibit 94 Memo regarding Odom's complaint dated February 28, 2018 (Doc. 36-55)

95. Defense Exhibit 95 Email chain regarding Odom's complaint against Grizzell (Doc. 36-67)
96. Defense Exhibit 96 CPD Routing Sheet dated January 28, 2019 (Doc. 36-69)
97. Defense Exhibit 97 Memo regarding Mabry Investigation (Doc. 36-18)
98. Defense Exhibit 98 Nicholas Reaper Letter (Doc. 36-26)
99. Defense Exhibit 99 IAB Recommendations regarding Mabry (Doc. 36-27)
100. Defense Exhibit 100 Memo Knight to Dunlap regarding Grunkemeyer (Doc. 36-28)
101. Defense Exhibit 101 AUDIO 001 Lt. McFadden's interview.3.29.17.
102. Defense Exhibit 102 AUDIO 002 Cmdr. Grizzell's interview.3.30.17
103. Defense Exhibit 103 AUDIO 003 Sgt. Ramsey's interview.A.3.31.17
104. Defense Exhibit 104 AUDIO 004 Sgt. Ramsey's interview.B.3.31.17
105. Defense Exhibit 105 AUDIO 005 Sgt. Tate's interview. 4.20.17
106. Defense Exhibit 106 AUDIO 006 Off. Johnson.1.5.12.17
107. Defense Exhibit 107 AUDIO 007 Off. Johnson.11.5.12.17
108. Defense Exhibit 108 AUDIO 008 Off. Morefield.1.5.12.17
109. Defense Exhibit 109 AUDIO 009 Off. Morefield.11.5.12.17
110. Defense Exhibit 110 AUDIO 010 Brandon Thompson.interview.5.16.17
111. Defense Exhibit 111 AUDIO 011 Measha Spencer.interview.5.16.17
112. Defense Exhibit 112 AUDIO 012 Measha Spencer.5.17.17.A
113. Defense Exhibit 113 AUDIO 013 Measha Spencer.5.17.17.B
114. Defense Exhibit 114 AUDIO 014 Off. Casto interview.6.20.17
115. Defense Exhibit 115 AUDIO 015 Off. Gawronski interview.6.20.17
116. Defense Exhibit 116 AUDIO 016 Sgt. Odom interview.6.20.17
117. Defense Exhibit 117 AUDIO 017 Off. Dupler interview.6.20.17
118. Defense Exhibit 118 AUDIO 018 Off. Sebastiano. interview.6.20.17
119. Defense Exhibit 119 AUDIO 019 FCCC inmate call.5.16.17 1249PM

- 120. Defense Exhibit 120 AUDIO 020 Sgt. Guglielmi.I.interview.6.22.17
- 121. Defense Exhibit 121 AUDIO 021 Off. Reaper. 6.22.17
- 122. Defense Exhibit 122 AUDIO 022 Off. Hunter. 6.27.17
- 123. Defense Exhibit 123 AUDIO 023 Sgt. Hurst.interview.6.27.17
- 124. Defense Exhibit 124 AUDIO 024 Off. Kretzmann.interview.6.28.17
- 125. Defense Exhibit 125 AUDIO 025 Off. Tobin.interview.6.28.17
- 126. Defense Exhibit 126 AUDIO 026 Off. J.Kasza.interview.6.28.17
- 127. Defense Exhibit 127 AUDIO 027 OA II Meghan Sicilian interview.1.7.5.17
- 128. Defense Exhibit 128 AUDIO 028 OA II Meghan Sicilian interview.2.7.5.17
- 129. Defense Exhibit 129 AUDIO 029 Sgt. Smith-Hughes interview. 7.5.17
- 130. Defense Exhibit 130 AUDIO 030 Off. A. Kasza 7.5.17
- 131. Defense Exhibit 131 AUDIO031 Off. Derdziinski.7.5.17
- 132. Defense Exhibit 132 AUDIO 032 Off. Estep interview. 7. 7.17
- 133. Defense Exhibit 133 AUDIO 033 Off. White.interview.7.18.17
- 134. Defense Exhibit 134 AUDIO 034 Sgt. Ramsey's interview.C.7.18.17
- 135. Defense Exhibit 135 AUDIO 035 Off. Connelly.interview. 7.18.17
- 136. Defense Exhibit 136 AUDIO 036 Off. Bogard interview.7.18.17
- 137. Defense Exhibit 137 AUDIO 037 Sgt. Coleman interview. 7.20.17
- 138. Defense Exhibit 138 AUDIO 038 Off. Jones interview. 7.20.17
- 139. Defense Exhibit 139 AUDIO 039 Off. James interview. 7.27.17
- 140. Defense Exhibit 140 AUDIO 040 Off. Mottinger interview. 7.28.17
- 141. Defense Exhibit 141 AUDIO 041 Off. Mitchell interview.7.28.17
- 142. Defense Exhibit 142 AUDIO 042 Off. Morefield.111.8.2.17
- 143. Defense Exhibit 143 AUDIO 043 Lt. McFadden VM to Off. Morefield.3.6.17
- 144. Defense Exhibit 144 AUDIO 044 Sgt. Guglielmi.II.interview.8.2.17

- 145. Defense Exhibit 145 AUDIO 045 Cmdr. Springer interview. 8.8.17
- 146. Defense Exhibit 146 AUDIO 046 Off. Mottinger interview.8.17.17
- 147. Defense Exhibit 147 AUDIO 047 Cmdr. Gardner interview.8.18.17
- 148. Defense Exhibit 148 AUDIO 048 Cmdr. Gardner interview.8.31.17
- 149. Defense Exhibit 149 AUDIO 049 10.16.17 Erdeljac VM RE Lt. McFadden interview
- 150. Defense Exhibit 150 AUDIO 050 Erdeljac VM
- 151. Defense Exhibit 151 AUDIO 051 Tipton VM 1
- 152. Defense Exhibit 152 AUDIO 052 Tipton VM.2
- 153. Defense Exhibit 153 AUDIO 053 Ms. Tipton reschedule
- 154. Defense Exhibit 154 AUDIO 054 Lt. McFadden's interview.10.26.17
- 155. Defense Exhibit 155 AUDIO 055 Lt. McFadden's interview.11.2.17.A
- 156. Defense Exhibit 156 AUDIO 056 Lt. McFadden's interview.11.2.17.8
- 157. Defense Exhibit 157 AUDIO 057 Sgt. Edley interview.11.2.17
- 158. Defense Exhibit 158 AUDIO 058 Lt. McFadden's interview.11.16.17
- 159. Defense Exhibit 159 AUDIO 059 Lt. McFadden's interview.11.28.17
- 160. Defense Exhibit 160 AUDIO 060 Lt. McFadden's interview.12.6.17
- 161. Defense Exhibit 161 AUDIO 061 Chief's hearing 5.15.18
- 162. Defense Exhibit 162 AUDIO 062 Sebastiano.6. 7.18 SECONDARY
- 163. Defense Exhibit 163 AUDIO 063 Tobin.6.28.18 SECONDARY
- 164. Defense Exhibit 164 AUDIO 064 J.Kasza.6.28.18 SECONDARY
- 165. Defense Exhibit 165 AUDIO 065 Johnson.6.28.18 SECONDARY
- 166. Defense Exhibit 166 AUDIO 066 Ramsey.6.28.18 SECONDARY
- 167. Defense Exhibit 167 AUDIO 067 Estepp.6.29.18 SECONDARY
- 168. Defense Exhibit 168 AUDIO 068 Tate.6.29.18 SECONDARY
- 169. Defense Exhibit 169 AUDIO 069 Coleman.6.29.18 SECONDARY

170. Defense Exhibit 170 AUDIO 070 Morefield.6.29.18 SECONDARY

171. Defense Exhibit 171 AUDIO 071 Kretzman. 7.3.18 SECONDARY

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Westley M. Phillips

Susan E. Williams (0073375)

Westley M. Phillips (0077728)

Paul M. Bernhart (0079543)

Assistant City Attorneys

CITY OF COLUMBUS, DEPARTMENT OF LAW

ZACH KLEIN, CITY ATTORNEY

77 North Front Street, Columbus, Ohio 43215

(614) 645-7385 / (614) 645-6949 (fax)

sewilliams@columbus.gov

wmphilips@columbus.gov

pmbernhart@columbus.gov

Attorneys for Defendant

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that, on May 2, 2022, I electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court by using this Court's e-Filing System, which will send a notice of this electronic filing to all counsel of record in this matter:

/s/ Westley M. Phillips
Westley M. Phillips (0077728)